UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ORIGINAL

EDMIN ALICEA,

Plaintiff,

-against-

13 CV 7073 (JGK)

THE CITY OF NEW YORK, POLICE OFFICER ALEJANDRO RIVAS (TAX 925987), DETECTIVE RICHARD BABOOLAL (TAX 924906), AND POLICE SERGEANT FREDY CRUZ (TAX 915528),

Defendants.

Y

26 Court Street Brooklyn, New York

August 19, 2014 10:17 a.m.

EXAMINATION BEFORE TRIAL of ALEJANDRO RIVAS, a Defendant in the above-entitled action, taken by the Plaintiff, held at the above-mentioned time and place, pursuant to Notice, taken before Julia C. Fernandez, a Notary Public of the State of New York.

ALEJANDRO RIVAS

		Page 2
)1		J
2	APPEARANCES	
3		
. 4	REIBMAN & WEINER Attorneys for Plaintiff	
5	26 Court Street, Suite 1808 Brooklyn, New York 11242	
6	BY: JESSICA MASSIMI, ESQ.	
7		4 · · ·
- 8		
9		
10	OFFICE OF THE CORPORATION COUNSEL Attorneys for Defendants	
11	100 Church Street New York, New York 10007	
12	BY: BRIAN J. FARRAR, ESQ.	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1	RIVAS
2	A Yes.
3	Q How long have you been a member of the
4	conditions unit?
5	A I'd say approximately eight years, nine
6	years.
7	Q Did you have any specific duties during
8	that shift on March 27, 2012?
9	A I was assigned to be the apprehension
10	car.
11	Q What is the apprehension car?
12	A If we had an operation, if it was an
13	ongoing operation and I was assigned any
14	particular individual, we were supposed to be
15	responsible to follow that individual and
16	apprehend them with a description of that
17	individual.
18	Q Were you given a description of any
19	individuals at the beginning of your shift that
20	day?

- 21 A Not at the beginning of the day that
- 22 day. It was at the time where I conducted an
- 23 arrest that day.
- Q I'm just asking if you had any specific
- 25 duties during your shift that day?

	RIVAS
A	Yes, apprehension car.
Q	What do you mean apprehension car?
A	You were responsible whenever they're
giving you	an individual, give you a description,
direction	of flight
Q	Who gives you the description?
A	The observation officer.
Q	Who's the observation officer?
A	That day it was Police Officer Baboolal,
B-A-B-O-O	-L-A-L.
Q	Were you working with Officer Baboolal
that day?	
А	He was the observing officer, I was with
another o	fficer at the apprehension car. He was
not in the	e car with me.
Q	Who was in your car that day?
Α	I believe it was Police Officer Arico.
Q	Is he your partner?
A	Not right now, he's in another unit
right now	
, Q	Was he your partner at that time?
A	Yes.
Q	Were both of you in an unmarked or
	Q A giving you direction Q A Q A B-A-B-O-O- Q that day? A another on not in the Q A right now

25

marked car?

1	RIVAS
2	A I believe it was a marked car.
3	Q It was just you and Officer Arico?
4	A I believe it was also Officer McGrath.
5	Q What's Officer McGrath's first name?
6	A Terence.
7	Q When you began your shift that day, what
8	did you do at the beginning of your shift that
9	day?
10	A We just got together in the office.
11	Q Who's we?
12	A The unit, my sergeant and the members of
13	the unit.
14	Q What did you do when you got together?
15	A We actually got together and decided
16	what type of operation we were gonna have that
17	day.
18	Q What type of operation did you decide
19	you were going to have that day?
20	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
21	A That was decided by the sergeant and he
22	decides who's gonna be in the apprehension car and
23	who's gonna be in the observation point.
24	O Who was your sergeant that day?

Sergeant Cruz.

25

А

RIVAS 1 Did Sergeant Cruz decide that you were 2 going to be in a certain car with Officer Arico 3 and Officer McGrath? 4 Α Yes. 5 What car were you in? Q 6 I don't remember the number of the car. 7 Α You said it was the apprehension car? 0 Α Yes. 9 Who was driving the car that day? 0 10 I don't remember who was driving the car 11 А 12 that day. Would it be in your memo book? 13 Q No. Α 14 Were you driving the car that day? 15 0 Α No. 16 Were you in uniform that day? 17 0 Yes. 18 Α Were Officers McGrath and Arico in 0 19 uniform that day? 20 Α Yes. 21 Were you in a marked or unmarked car? Q 22 Α Marked. 23 Had you worked that assignment before? 0 24

25

Α

Yes.

1	RIVAS
2	Q What were you told at the beginning of
3	your shift that day?
4	A That I was gonna be in the apprehension
5	car.
6	Q What did you understand that to mean?
7	A That I was gonna be responsible to do
8	pickups. Pickups mean if it was somebody that
9	needed to be apprehended, we would go and
10	apprehend them.
11	Q How do you know if somebody has to be
12	apprehended?
13	A It has to be radioed in by the observing
14	officer which would give you the direction of
15	flight and the description of the individual.
16	Q Who was the observing officer during
17	your shift this day, on March 27, 2012?
18	A You asked me that question earlier, it's
19	PO Baboolal.
20	Q Do you know where Sergeant Cruz was that
21	day?
22	A I don't remember where he was.
23	Q Can you describe for me the geographical
24	confines of the precinct that you're assigned to?
25	A We cover from 155 to 179, from the east

RIVAS 1 river to the west river. 2 Who was the operator of the vehicle that 3 day that you were in? 4 I told you, I don't remember. 5 Is there usually somebody who is 6 assigned to be the vehicle operator? 7 Yes, whoever's assigned, you know, given Α 8 the keys; but I don't remember who it was that 9 10 day. Who usually assigns the person to be the 11 0 vehicle operator? 12 Usually, when they give us the car, 13 anybody could be the operator. 14 Who gives you the car? 0 15 The sergeant or the desk, whoever is 16 assigning, you know, assigns the car. Once they 17 assign the car they have to write it down. 18 Who usually assigns the car? Q 19 The sergeant. Α 20 Who decides who's going to operate the 21 0 vehicle? 22 Anybody could take it. 23 Α Do you decide amongst yourselves? Q 24

Α

25

Yes.

·	
1	RIVAS
2	Q Does that decision or assignment get
3	recorded anywhere?
4	A Some do, some don't.
5	Q Are you required to record the vehicle
6	operator?
7	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
8	A I believe so.
9	Q Did you record who the vehicle operator
10	was on that day?
11	A No, I didn't.
12	Q Was there somebody in your vehicle who
13	was assigned to write down observations?
14	A Observation of what?
15	Q When you were on patrol that day, were
16	you required to make observations?
17	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
18	A I'm not the observing officer, I told
19	you it was Baboolal. I'm just the apprehension
20	but everybody is observing.
21	Q That's my point, so as a police officer
22	are you required to make observations even when
23	you're working apprehension?
24	A Yes.

Where do you record those observations?

25

1	RIVAS
2	A In my memo book. Explain this again,
3	what type of observations, everything that I see
4	throughout the day or an incident of an arrest?
5	Q For instance, whoever was driving the
6	vehicle, where would you have been required to
7	record that?
8	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
9	A The recorder of the RMP you're saying,
10	yes.
11	Q Where would you have been required to
12	record that?
13	A My memo book.
14	Q Is there a reason that you would not
15	have recorded that in your memo book?
16	A No reason.
17	Q You were in a vehicle with Officers
18	McGrath and Arico, correct?
19	A Yes.
20	Q Were any of them assigned to write down
21	their observations specifically?
22	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
23	A Everybody's responsible for their memo
24	hook entries

There's no assigned recorder in your

25

1	RIVAS
2	vehicle?
3	A No.
4	MS. MASSIMI: We're going to call for
	production at this time for the memo books of
5	
6	Officers Arico and McGrath.
7	(DOCUMENT REQUESTED)
8	MR. FARRAR: Put it in writing and we'll
9	take it under advisement.
10	MS. MASSIMI: Sure.
11	Q Explain to me what was the first thing
12	that you did once the three of you left the
13	precinct in the marked NYPD vehicle that day?
14	A We positioned ourselves on the confines
15	of the 33rd Precinct.
16	Q What do you mean position yourselves?
17	A Basically, far away from the observing
18	point.
19	Q What's the observing point?
20	A At that time Officer Baboolal, I
21	believe, was observing 172 between Audubon and
22	St. Nicholas Avenue.
23	Q What time did your shift begin that day?
24	A 0930.
25	Q What time did you leave the precinct in

RIVAS 1 the vehicle that day? 2 I'm not sure, I don't remember. 3 Would it be in your memo book? Maybe. 5 Where did you first go when you left the б precinct that day? 7 Exactly where I positioned myself, I 8 couldn't be able to tell you but it was not close 9 to 172. 10 Is there a reason why it would not have 11 been close to 172? 12 We usually don't park too close where 13 the observation point is at. 14 Why is that? Q 15 Because then the dealer would notice 16 that we're watching them. 17 The observation officer, is he usually 18 in plainclothes? 19 Α Yes. 20 Was Officer Baboolal in plainclothes 21 0 that day? 22 I believe so, I'm not sure. 23 \mathbf{A} Do you know if he was operating a 24

25

vehicle?

1	RIVAS
2	A I'm not sure.
3	Q Do you know if he was working alone or
4	with someone?
5	A I'm not sure.
6	Q Was there a time that day when you
7	arrived at the location of 172nd Street between
8	Broadway and Fort Washington?
9	A Yes.
10	Q What type of vehicle brought you to that
11	location?
12	A I mentioned marked vehicle.
13	Q Who was driving the vehicle?
14	A I told you before, I don't know who was
15	driving the vehicle. I don't remember.
16	Q Would the same person have been driving
17	the entire shift?
18	A Yes.
19	Q Where were you sitting in the vehicle?
20	A I don't remember.
21	Q Was there anyone else in the vehicle at
22	that time?
23	A Yes, the officers that I mentioned.
2.4	O At the time you arrived at 172nd Street

between Broadway and Fort Washington it was you,

RIVAS 1 Officer Arico, and Officer McGrath in the vehicle? 2 Α Yes. 3 Were there any other NYPD vehicles following you? 5 Α No. 6 Was your vehicle following any other NYPD vehicle towards that area? 8 No. Had you ever participated in other 10 arrests with Officer Arico and Officer McGrath 11 12 together before? MR. FARRAR: Objection. 13 Α Yes. 14 How many times? 15 Q Many times. Α 16 Had you ever participated in arrests 17 with Officer Baboolal? 18 Yes. Α 19 How many times? 20 Dozens of arrests. Α 21 Have you ever made any arrests 0 22 previously where you were in the apprehension 23 vehicle and Officer Baboolal was the observer? 24

Repeat that again, please.

1	RIVAS
2	Q Other than that March 27, 2012 incident
3	had you ever participated in any other arrests
4	where you were in the apprehension vehicle and
5	Officer Baboolal was the observer?
6	A Yes.
7	Q How many?
8	A Many times.
9	Q What brought your attention to the
10	vicinity of 172nd Street between Broadway and Fort
11	Washington?
12	A Officer Baboolal had given us the
13	description of a male Hispanic, heading towards
14	our direction going west on 172nd Street.
15	Q Where was your vehicle located when you
16	received that call from Officer Baboolal?
17	A I believe we were parked southbound
18	between 172, 173 and Broadway.
19	Q Where were you going immediately before
20	responding to that call?
21	A I was not going nowhere, I was
22	stationed. I don't remember that well but I was
23	parked between those streets.
24	O What was the description that Officer

Baboolal gave to you?

1	RIVAS
2	A I believe it was male Hispanic.
3	Q What did Officer Baboolal tell you he
4	had observed?
5	A Hand to hand transaction.
6	Q Can you explain to me specifically what
7	Officer Baboolal said?
8	A Not exactly what he said. Once he
9	observed the hand to hand he puts over the
10	description of the individual and the direction of
11	flight. He doesn't explain to us over the radio
12	what he saw.
13	Q How did you receive this information
14	from Officer Baboolal?
15	A Point-to-point radio.
16	Q Did you record this information in your
17.	memo book?
18	A No.
19	Q Is there any particular reason?
20	A You cannot stop and write that down
21	cause at that moment you're going to go and
22	conduct an apprehension and then once you locate
23	that individual you proceed to do the
24	apprehension. And then, yes, I record the
25	apprehension that day of that individual. I

1	RIVAS
2	recorded it in my memo book.
3	Q After receiving this point-to-point
4	radio contact from Officer Baboolal that you've
5	just described, how long did it take you to arrive
6	at the location?
7	A Seconds, minutes.
8	Q How many seconds?
9	A I'm not sure of the time frame, how long
10	it took.
11	Q Did you make contact with an individual
12	in that area once you arrived there?
13	A Yes.
14	Q Can you describe this individual?
15	A A little heavyset, I don't recall the
16	height but it was the same description given to us
17	by Officer Baboolal.
18	Q But you don't remember what it was?
19	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
20	A Not right now.
21	Q Before seeing that individual at that
22	location had you ever observed him before?
23	A That individual?
24	Q Yes.

If I seen him before that day?

25

Α

		Page	8
) 1	RIVAS		
2	Q Yes.		
3	A No.		
4	Q Had you seen him earlier in the day?		
5	A No.		
6	Q Had you ever heard about Edmin Alicea		
7	before?		
8	A I believe his name is Edwin.		
9	Q It's Edmin Alicea.		
10	A Edmin, no.		
11	Q Were you the first person to observe him		
12	when your vehicle arrived at that location?		
13	MR. FARRAR: Objection.		
14	A When I arrived to which location?		
15	Q The location where you apprehended him.		
16	A Yes, and I believe the other ones, of		
17	course, saw him too but I don't know what they		
18	recall. I know what I observed.		
19	Q What did you observe?		
20	A I observed him coming in the direction		
21	that Officer Baboolal had stated that I was		
22	walking towards. I proceeded to get out of the		
23	vehicle, at that moment I was very close to him.		
24	Want me to continue?		

25

Go on.

1	RIVAS
2	A I proceeded to exit the RMP and the
3	other officers too got very close to him and as
4	I'm approaching him he notices that we were
5	coming. As I request for him to turn around to
6	see that we are the police, he proceeded to place
7	a plastic bag into his mouth.
8	Q Had you been parked before you received
9	that point-to-point radio contact?
10	A I was between 172 and 173.
11	Q On Broadway?
12	A Yes.
13	Q What route did your vehicle take from
14	that location to the location where you
15	A We were already closer to 172 when he
16	arrives from St. Nicholas.
17	Q Can you explain that
18	A As he was walking west towards 172 and
19	Broadway, we were already there (indicating)
20	facing south at 172 and Broadway, between 172 and
21	173.
22	Q He was walking west on 172?
23	A Yes.
24	Q What direction was your vehicle driving

when you arrived at the location?

1	RIVAS	
2	A I was already there when he reached	
3	Broadway and crossed the street.	
4	Q What route did you take to arrive at	
5	that location?	
6	A Broadway.	
7	Q Which direction?	
8	A South, I was facing south.	
9	Q You were parked facing south or you	
10	drove	
11	A Facing south, yes. I was parked facing	
12	south on Broadway, St. Nicholas, 172 (indicating).	
13	If you walk from St. Nicholas, 172 towards 172 and	
14	Broadway, you're going west (indicating). I'm	
15	parked closer to 172, between 172 and 173 and	
16	Broadway facing south.	
17	MS. MASSIMI: Give me a moment.	
18		
19	(Whereupon, a brief recess was	
20	taken.)	
21		
22	Q I'm going to show you a map so that you	
23	can explain to me exactly where you were in	
24	relation to the plaintiff and in relation to the	
25	observation unit? (Handing document).	

		Page
) 1	RIVAS	
2	A Repeat that.	
3	Q I'm going to show you a map so that you	
4	can mark on here where you were?	
5	MR. FARRAR: Do you want that marked for	
6	Identification?	
7	MS. MASSIMI: Yes. Can you mark this.	
8		
9	(Whereupon, the above-referred	
10	to document was marked as	
11	Plaintiff's Exhibit 1 for	
_\ 12	Identification, as of this	
13	date.)	
14		
15	Q Can you take a look at this and mark	
16	with an A where you were on?	
17	A Approximately, not exactly, right? What	
18	I could remember is	
19	Q Mark with an A where you were when you	
20	received the point-to-point radio contact?	
21	A (Perusing document). That, I don't	
22	remember. Could've been in the vicinity up here	
23	(indicating) anywhere and then once I get a	
324	description, then I get closer. Before I got to	
√ 25	the location I cannot remember where I was, we	

RIVAS 1 were far away. Once you get a description, then 2 you move to where you need to be. 3 So you don't remember what you were 0 4 doing before you received the point-to-point 5 radio contact? MR. FARRAR: Objection. Where was I at? Α 8 What were you doing before you received 9 the call? 10 I was driving around far away from the Α 11 location. 12 What were you doing, what were your 13 0 duties? 14 Nothing, just waiting for a description. Α 15 Once you received that point-to-point 16 radio contact, how did you arrive at the scene? 17 I came down and kind of stopped between Α 18 these two blocks (indicating) 173 and 172 on 19 Broadway looking south. 20 Where were you when you first observed 21 Mr. Alicea?

- Right there (indicating). Α 23
- Right where? 24

22

Right where that point is at. 25 Α

RIVAS What did you do once you observed him? 2 We knew each other, that was the Α 3 description of the other individual. 4 You what? 5 We knew right away that was the 6 description that was given by Officer Baboolal. 7 How did you know that right away? 0 8 The description of the clothing. 9 What was the clothing that he was 10 wearing? 11 I have to refresh my (pause). 12 What was Mr. Alicea doing when you first 13 saw him? 14 Walking, crossing over going towards Α 15 Fort Washington. 16 Did you park your vehicle at this location 17 that you've marked? 18 Yes, around that area, I believe so; it 19 was around there we got out. 20 When you observed Mr. Alicea, did you 21 proceed to follow him with your vehicle or did you 22 park --23 No, on foot. 24 Α

Where did you park your vehicle?

25

1 RIVAS

- 2 A Where you have the mark in there and
- 3 then he was coming west, he crossed the street, we
- 4 got out, and we apprehended him right there.
- 5 Q Where?
- 6 A (Indicating).
- 7 Q Did you observe any other NYPD vehicles
- 8 in the vicinity at that time?
- 9 A No.
- 10 Q Do you know if Officer Baboolal was in a
- 11 vehicle that day?
- 12 A No.
- 13 Q Did Mr. Alicea do anything that you
- 14 observed that gave rise to reasonable cause for
- 15 you to believe that he had committed a crime?
- 16 MR. FARRAR: Objection.
- 17 A He placed a small green object into his
- 18 mouth as soon as he knew we were right behind him,
- 19 we were very close to him. I kept on walking, as
- 20 I asked him to turn around so he would notice that
- 21 it was the police, he placed it in his mouth.
- 22 Q What did you say to him?
- 23 A Nothing, I just saw him place it in his
- 24 mouth. In my experience and the odor emanating
- 25 where he was at and the characteristics of the bag

RIVAS 1 that he put in his mouth, it was marijuana. 2 How much marijuana would you say it was? 3 I don't know, I can't tell you that. Α Did anyone say anything to Mr. Alicea? 5 No. 6 Did you hear Officer Arico say anything 7 to Mr. Alicea? 8 No. 9 Α Did you hear Officer McGrath say Q 10 anything to Mr. Alicea? 11 Α No. 12 What side of the street was Mr. Alicea 13 on when you first observed him? 14 The north, going west on the north side 15 Α of 172. 16 Who made the decision to stop the 17 vehicle at the location on Broadway between 172 18 and 173? 19 Whoever was the operator, we just parked

- Who got out of the vehicle first? Q 22
- I don't remember. Α 23
- Did you have any physical contact with 24
- Mr. Alicea? 25

there.

20

1	RIVAS
2	A We placed him under arrest, we told him
3	to put his hands behind his back.
4	Q Were you the only person that had
5	physical contact with Mr. Alicea at the scene of
6	the arrest?
7	A I believe the other officers too but I
8	don't remember who did what.
9	Q Who first had physical contact with Mr.
10	Alicea?
11	A Who saw him first?
12	Q You were with Officer McGrath and
13	Officer Arico?
14	A Yes.
15	Q Out of the three of you who first made
16	contact with Mr. Alicea?
17	A I believe it was me, I was the one who
18	observed it. I don't know what they observed but
19	I observed it and we placed him under arrest.
20	Q What was the first physical contact that
21	you had with Mr. Alicea?
22	A I told him to put his hands behind his
23	back and placed him under arrest, that was it.
24	Q Which part of your body first made

contact with Mr. Alicea?

) 1		RIVAS
2	A	I don't remember.
3	Q	Which part of his body did you first
4	make cont	act with?
5	\mathbf{A}_{\cdot}	I don't remember.
6	Q	Describe the physical contact that you
7	had with	Mr. Alicea?
8	A	Grab him, put his hands behind his back,
9	place him	in cuffs.
10	Q	What part of his body did you grab?
11	A	I said I don't remember.
12	.Q	Did you observe Officer Arico or Officer
13	McGrath h	ave any physical contact with Mr. Alicea?
14	A	No, just assisting me in the arrest.
15	Q	When did you learn that you were not
16	supposed	to use choke holds?
17		MR. FARRAR: Objection.
18	A	When did I learn that?
19	Q	Yes.
20	A	I believe my whole career.
21	Q	Did you place Mr. Alicea in handcuffs?
22	A	I don't remember.
23	Q	Did you observe Officer McGrath place
24	Mr Alice	ea in handcuffs?

I don't remember.

25

Α

1	RIVAS
2	Q Did you observe Officer Arico place Mr.
3	Alicea in handcuffs?
4	A I don't remember.
5	Q How was Mr. Alicea handcuffed?
6	A His hands behind his back.
7	Q Did you observe Mr. Alicea interacting
8	with anyone at the scene?
9	A No.
10	Q After you observed Mr. Alicea swallowing
11	what you said was marijuana, what did you do to
12	attempt to retrieve that item?
13	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
14	A I didn't do nothing.
15	Q Did you observe Mr. Alicea exchange
16	items with anyone at the scene of the arrest?
17	A No.
18	Q What had Officer Baboolal told you
19	during that radio notification a few minutes
20	earlier?
21	A The description of the individual and
22	the direction of flight.
23	Q What had he told you that he believed
2.4	this individual had done?

He had observed him doing an exchange at

- 1 RIVAS
- 2 the location he observed him.
- 3 O Did he describe the other individual who
- 4 he said was involved in this exchange?
- 5 A Not at that moment.
- 6 Q Did you ever receive a description of
- 7 this other individual who Mr. Baboolal said was
- 8 involved in this exchange?
- 9 A I don't know.
- 10 MR. FARRAR: Objection.
- 11 O Did Mr. Baboolal indicate that he was
- 12 going to follow this second individual?
- 13 A No, I don't remember.
- 14 Q Who assigned you to be the arresting
- 15 officer for this arrest?
- 16 A Sergeant Cruz.
- 17 Q At what point were you assigned to be
- 18 the arresting officer?
- 19 A Back at the precinct.
- 20 Q Did you ever formulate an opinion in
- 21 your own mind that Mr. Alicea should be arrested?
- MR. FARRAR: Objection.
- 23 A When he was apprehended; when he ate the
- 24 marijuana at the scene, that's when we decided to
- 25 put him in handcuffs.

1	RIVAS
2	Q What crimes or violations did you
3	believe Mr. Alicea had committed at that point?
4	A Tampering with evidence, trying to
5	destroy evidence.
6	Q What was your basis for believing that
7	he had committed that crime?
8	A As soon as he observed the officers come
9	towards him closer, he placed it in his mouth.
10	Q Which hand did he use to place it in his
11	mouth?
12	A I don't remember.
13	Q Did you conduct an investigation at the
14	scene of the incident?
15	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
16	A What type of investigation, no.
17	Q Do you know if anyone conducted an
18	investigation?
19	A No.
20	Q Did you ever attempt to find this other
21	individual involved in the alleged hand to hand
22	drug transaction?
23	A Yes, we try.
24	Q When did you attempt to find that
25	individual?

I		RIVAS

- 2 A I don't know how many minutes after
- 3 that, I don't remember. I don't remember what
- 4 time but, of course, we try to get that other
- 5 individual but I don't know what happened.
- 6 Q How did you try to get that other
- 7 individual?
- 8 A I guess another apprehension car. I'm
- 9 not sure, I can't tell you.
- 10 Q Who had received the description of this
- 11 other individual?
- 12 A I would not know, PO Baboolal would be
- 13 able to tell you.
- 14 O Do you know if there's any video
- 15 surveillance around 172nd Street between Broadway
- 16 and Fort Washington?
- 17 A Not that I know of.
- 18 Q Did you ever see any video surveillance
- 19 of the arrest?
- 20 A No.
- 21 Q Were there any video cameras inside of
- 22 your car that day?
- 23 A No.
- Q Do you know of any witnesses to the
- 25 arrest other than yourself, Mr. Alicea, Officers

RIVAS 1 McGrath and Arico? 2 No. 3 Α Did you ever speak to Mr. Alicea about 4 this incident? 5 6 Α No. Did you hear Mr. Alicea make any 7 statements to you at any time? 8 No. 9 Α Do you know if Officer McGrath heard Mr. 10 Alicea make any statement? 11 Not that I know of. 12 Α Do you know if Officer Arico heard Mr. 13 Alicea make any statement? 14 Not that I know of. 15 Did Mr. Alicea resist your efforts to 16 arrest him? 17 Α No. 18 Did you ever observe Mr. Alicea 19 complaining to anyone that the handcuffs were too 20 tight or causing him pain? 21 Not to me. Α 22 Did you hear him complaining to anyone? 23 Q No. Α 24

What about in the car?

25

			Page 93
1		RIVAS	
2	A	No.	
3	Q	At that precinct?	
4	А	No.	
5	· Q	Did you observe Mr. Alicea's hands and	
6	wrists at	any time after you had handcuffed him?	
7	A	I don't remember but he was not	
8	complaini	ng.	
9	Q	After you handcuffed Mr. Alicea what was	
10	your dest	ination?	
11		MR. FARRAR: Objection.	
12	A	The 33rd Precinct.	
13	Q	Did you make any stops along the way?	
14	А	No.	
1 5	Q	You headed straight from the scene of	
16	the arres	t to the 33rd Precinct?	
17	A	Yes.	
18	Q	Did you pick up anyone else on the way?	
19	A	No.	
20	Q	After you arrived at the precinct what	
21	was the f	First thing you did?	
22	A	We placed him in the cells area.	
23	Q	How long after arriving at the precinct	
24	did you p	place Mr. Alicea in the cell?	

A couple of minutes after we do the

25

Α

```
RIVAS
1
    pedigree.
2
               What's that?
          0
3
               His name, address, belongings, whatever.
          Α
4
               Do you take a picture of him at that
          0
5
     point?
6
               No.
7
          Α
               When does his picture get taken?
          0
 8
               After the online is done, fingerprints.
 9
          Α
               So his picture is taken when you're
10
     doing the fingerprints?
11
               Yes.
12
          Α
               Who does that?
13
          0
               Anybody could do it.
          Α
14
               Did you recover any illegal substance or
          Q
15
     item from Mr. Alicea during the course of this
16
     arrest?
17
                No.
          Α
18
                At any point did you recover anything
           0
19
     illegal from him?
20
                No.
21
           Α
                Did you try to take Mr. Alicea to the
22
           Q
     hospital at any point while he was in custody?
23
                No, he never complained to me that he
24
```

wanted to go to the hospital.

RIVAS	
Q How did you plan to retrieve this	
marijuana that you claim he swallowed?	
A While I was doing the paperwork Sergeant	
Cruz took care of that. Actually Sergeant Cruz,	
my sergeant, made the decision but I was doing my	
paperwork at that time.	
Q What decision did Sergeant Cruz make?	
MR. FARRAR: Objection.	
A I don't know what was the conversation	
he had or what he did.	
Q What decision are you referring to when	
you say Sergeant Cruz made the decision?	
A The decision if the prisoner needs to go	
to the hospital or not.	
Q How do you know that he made that	
decision?	
A Because he was the sergeant in charge.	
Q Did you hear him say anything that would	
indicate to you that he made this decision or had	
spoken to the arrestee about that?	
A No.	
Q Does the patrol guide say anything about	
fastening the seat belt of arrestees after you	
	Q How did you plan to retrieve this marijuana that you claim he swallowed? A While I was doing the paperwork Sergeant Cruz took care of that. Actually Sergeant Cruz, my sergeant, made the decision but I was doing my paperwork at that time. Q What decision did Sergeant Cruz make? MR. FARRAR: Objection. A I don't know what was the conversation he had or what he did. Q What decision are you referring to when you say Sergeant Cruz made the decision? A The decision if the prisoner needs to go to the hospital or not. Q How do you know that he made that decision? A Because he was the sergeant in charge. Q Did you hear him say anything that would indicate to you that he made this decision or had spoken to the arrestee about that? A No. Q Does the patrol guide say anything about

place them in your vehicle?

1	RIVAS
2	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
3	A I believe so.
4	Q What does it say about that?
5	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
, 6	A I believe that when you place them in
7	the car, you have to put the seat belt.
8	Q Was Mr. Alicea's seat belt fastened
9	inside the vehicle?
10	A I don't remember.
11	Q How fast did you drive from the scene of
12	the arrest to the precinct?
13	A At a normal speed.
14	Q How many turns did you make in driving
15	from the scene of the arrest to the precinct?
16	A I don't remember.
17	Q Did you make any sharp turns?
18	A No, not that I remember.
19	Q Did you make any stops on the way from
20	the scene of the arrest to the precinct?

Α No. 21

- Did you make any sudden stops? Q . 22
- Α No. 23
- Q Did you observe whether any part of Mr. 24
- Alicea's body came into contact with any part of 25

RIVAS 1 the interior of the vehicle while he was being 2 driven to the precinct? 3 No. Α 4 Did you observe whether Mr. Alicea was 5 bleeding while he was in the vehicle? 6 7 Α No. Did you observe blood on Mr. Alicea's 8 clothes in the vehicle? 9 Α No. 10 At any point while he was in custody did 11 0 you observe blood on Mr. Alicea's clothes? 12 Α No. 13 Did you observe blood on Mr. Alicea at Q 14 any point while he was in custody? 15 Α No. 16 Did you observe him bleeding at any 17 point while he was in custody? 18 19 Α No. Who removed Mr. Alicea from the vehicle 20 once you arrived at the precinct? 21 I don't remember. Α 22 Do you remember how he was removed from 23 0 the vehicle? 24

I don't remember.

25

Α

RIVAS 1 Did Mr. Alicea say anything to you once 2 he was removed from the vehicle? 3 No. Α 4 Was he taken directly from the vehicle 5 into the precinct? 6 Yes. 7 А Did he say anything on that walk from 8 the vehicle to the precinct? 9 No. 10 Once he was in the precinct, before he 11 was placed in the cell was Mr. Alicea made to sit 12 down anywhere?

- Α No. 14
- Was his physical and medical condition Q 15
- evaluated at the precinct? 16
- He was conscious, he was breathing, he Α 17
- was fine. We did the pedigree, he was standing 18
- 19 up.

- Were Mr. Alicea's handcuffs removed 20
- before he was placed in the cell? 21
- Once we bring him into the cells, we Α 22
- remove the handcuffs to proceed to take off the 23
- shoelaces and belt, if he has any. 24
- How much time elapsed from the time the 25

1	RIVAS	
2	handcuffs were first placed on Mr. Alicea until	
3	when they were removed?	
4	A I'd say no more than ten minutes, twelve	
.5	minutes max.	
6	Q Did you observe Mr. Alicea in any	
7	physical altercation with any other detainee while	
8	he was in your custody?	
9	A No.	
10	Q Did you observe him get into a physical	
11	altercation with any other officers?	
12	A No.	
13	Q How long after you arrived at the	
14	precinct was Mr. Alicea's photograph taken?	
15	A An hour after, an hour and a half after;	
16	I'm not sure of the time frame.	
17	MS. MASSIMI: Give me a moment.	
18		
19	(Whereupon, a brief recess was	
20	taken.)	
21		-
22	MS. MASSIMI: Can you read back the last	
23	question and answer.	
24		
25	(Whereupon, the requested	

```
RIVAS
1
                         testimony was read.)
2
3
               When you say you observed Mr. Alicea
4
          Q
    swallowing a plastic bag earlier, can you describe
5
     the bag?
6
               It's like an inch by an inch size of a
          Α
    plastic bag.
8
               What color was it?
 9
               Green, which I've been seeing for more
10
     than fourteen years.
11
12
          Q
               That bag was green?
               Yes, the bag was green.
          Α
13
               Was it a Ziploc bag?
          Q
14
15
          Α
               Yes.
               Were you working as part of an operation
          Q
16
     that day, did it have a name, the operation?
17
               No, it didn't have a name.
18
               What arrest paperwork did you fill out
19
          0
     as part of your job as the arresting officer for
20
     this case?
21
               An online.
          Α
22
          0
               What's that?
23
                Which is the pedigree of the defendant;
24
     his name, address, charge, and clothes description
```

٠		
1		RIVAS
2	and locat	ion of arrest.
3	Q	What other paperwork did you complete?
4	A	Any vouchers, we do a voucher. Voucher
5	is a numb	er assigned by the New York City Police
6	Departmer	at to an item or evidence.
7	Q	Is that all the paperwork you completed?
8	А	Yes.
9	Q	Which other officers were present while
10	you were	doing this paperwork?
11	A	Not that I remember.
12	Q	What do you mean?
13	А	Nobody that I remember.
14	Q	Did anyone advise or suggest to you what
15	you shou	ld put in those forms?
16	A	No.
17	Q	Did you consult with any of the other
18	officers	who were present about what should be
19	written	in the online booking sheet?
20	А	No.
21	Q	Did you consult anyone from NYPD legal
22	about wh	at to write?
23	А	No.
24		You filled out these forms without input

from anyone else?

1		RIVAS
2		MR. FARRAR: Objection.
3	A	Once I do the online, my supervisor
4	verifies	the arrest.
5	Q	That would be Sergeant Cruz?
6	A	Yes.
7	Q	What does it mean to verify an arrest?
8	А	That he authorized everything on the
9	online,	on the pedigree.
10	Q	Did he authorize everything on the
11	online?	
12	А	Yes.
13	Q	Did you speak to anyone from the
14	district	attorney's office about this arrest?
15	A	The ADA in charge, the district attorney
16	in charg	re.
17	Q	What was the ADA's name?
18	A	I don't remember the name.
19	- Q	Was it a man or a woman?
20	А	I don't remember.
21	Q	When did you first speak to him or her?
22	A	I believe it was that night over the
23	phone.	
24	Q	What did you explain to him or her?
, 2E	Δ.	T discussed the case, the arrest.

- 1 RIVAS
- 2 Q Did you ever testify about the incident
- 3 in any sort of criminal court proceeding?
- 4 A On this case?
- 5 Q Yes.
- 6 A No.
- 7 Q In any administrative or disciplinary
- 8 proceedings related to this case?
- 9 A No.
- 10 Q Did you ever testify about this incident
- 11 at the CCRB or anywhere else?
- 12 A This case?
- 13 Q Yes.
- 14 A No.
- 15 Q What about the internal affairs bureau?
- 16 A No.
- Once Mr. Alicea was placed in his cell,
- 18 how long was he in the cell before he was removed
- 19 the first time?
- 20 A Removed from what, the transport or for
- 21 the pictures?
- 22 Q How many times was he removed from his
- 23 cell in total?
- 24 A I believe once for the fingerprint and a
- 25 picture, which I stated earlier, hour, hour and a

- 1 RIVAS
- 2 half; I'm not sure about the time frame.
- 3 Q How long did it take to do the
- 4 photograph and the fingerprinting?
- 5 A It takes a half hour or less.
- 6 Q Once that was completed was he returned
- 7 to his cell?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q When he was removed from his cell to do
- 10 the photograph and the fingerprinting, were the
- 11 handcuffs placed on him?
- 12 A No.
- 13 Q Did you remove him from his cell the
- 14 first time?
- 15 A I don't remember.
- 16 Q When he was placed back in the cell, how
- 17 long was he in the cell until he was removed the
- 18 next time?
- 19 A I cannot tell you, I don't remember.
- 20 Q What was the reason that he was removed
- 21 the next time?
- 22 A For the transport. I believe he went
- 23 down to the courts so I don't know what time was
- 24 that.
- Q Were you still on duty at that time?

RIVAS
A I'm not sure. I don't remember if I was
still there when they took him.
Q Do you recognize this? (Handing
document).
A (Perusing document). Yes, it's my memo
book.
MS. MASSIMI: Can you mark this as
Plaintiff's Exhibit 2.
(Whereupon, the above-referred
to document was marked as
Plaintiff's Exhibit 2 for
Identification, as of this
date.)
Q Can you take a look at this. (Handing
document). Is this your memo book from March 27,
2012?
A (Perusing document). Yes.
Q I need you to read your entire memo book
to me?
A 33rd Precinct; 0930 by 1805; 0930
present for duty; post, conditions; PO Arico, PO

25

McGrath.

- 1 RIVAS
- 2 Q Post, conditions, what does that mean?
- 3 A That's your post, that's your assignment
- 4 for the day.
- 5 Q What does that notation indicate?
- 6 A Post?
- 7 Q Yes.
- 8 A That you're the condition on that day,
- 9 that's your assignment for the day.
- 10 Q Go on.
- 11 A PO Arico, PO McGrath and then it says PO
- 12 Regan.
- 13 Q Who's PO Regan?
- 14 A That's another officer in my unit too.
- 15 Q Why did you write his name down in your
- 16 memo book?
- 17 A He could've been in the van.
- 18 Q What van?
- 19 A No, let me rephrase that. He could've
- 20 been in the car or at the time that we started
- 21 going out. The way it is is that officers go in
- 22 and out. I just placed down the names that were
- 23 with me at the beginning of the tour -- not the
- 24 tour, the beginning of the time that I go out.
- 25 So, yes, I put down his name too.

1	RIVAS
2	Q It was your understanding that at the
3	beginning of the tour you were going to be sharing
4	the car with PO Arico, McGrath, and Regan?
5	A Yes.
6	MS. MASSIMI: We're going to call for
7	production of PO Regan's memo book. I'll put
8	it in writing with the others.
9	(DOCUMENT REQUESTED)
10	MR. FARRAR: Okay.
11	Q You can go on.
12	A It says, negative result, narcotic
13	search. We do that, make sure the car is clean
14	before we go out. At 1335, one under. One under,
15	Alicea, Edwin; male Hispanic; charge CPM,
16	tampering. 1400 confirm ID. That's the time that
17	Officer Baboolal confirmed the ID, actually
18	confirmed that that was the individual that he put
19	over the radio. Put down, 1430 online processing.
20	1515 fingerprint.
21	Q Does that mean that you would have been
22	the person that fingerprinted him?
23	A Yes.
24	Q And photographed him?

Yes. 1845 vouchers and then I finished

25

Α

- 1 RIVAS
- that day, it says here 0005.
- 3 Q What would have been the process for
- 4 Officer Baboolal to confirm the ID?
- 5 A He would come into the precinct which in
- 6 this case came in at 1400, looks at the
- 7 individual, goes to me, yes. It's confirmed,
- 8 that's the individual I called over. That's
- 9 confirmation.
- 10 Q Is that a complete and accurate account
- 11 of what you did that day?
- MR. FARRAR: Objection.
- 13 A There are many things, do many things;
- 14 it's just briefly --
- 15 Q What do you mean many things?
- 16 A Put him under arrest, the computer,
- 17 fingerprint. I put down fingerprint but also took
- 18 pictures, to briefly explain.
- 19 Q But you don't have in your memo book
- 20 that you took his picture?
- 21 A No, it's not there but it's part of the
- 22 fingerprint processing.
- 23 Q Again, your memo book you just read to
- 24 us, is that a complete and accurate account of
- 25 what you did during your shift that day?

1	RIVAS
2	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
3	A Yes.
4	Q The description that you gave me before
5	of the events that occurred from when you received
6	the point-to-point radio contact with Officer
7.	Baboolal until when you apprehended or detained
8	Mr. Alicea, was that a complete and accurate
9	account of the events that transpired during that
10	time frame?
11	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
12	A That's an account that I go over with
13	the district attorney, you know, the account of
14	what happened that day.
15	Q What do you mean that's the account you
16	went over with the district attorney?
17	A Can you repeat the question again.
18	Q The details that you described earlier
19	about what happened between when you received the
20	point-to-point radio contact from Officer Baboolal
21	up until when you detained Mr. Alicea, is that a
22	complete and accurate account of your
23	understanding of everything that transpired in
24	that time frame?

MR. FARRAR: Objection.

1	RIVAS
2	A Yes.
3	Q Is that the same account that you gave
4	to the district attorney?
5 .	A Of course.
6	Q Have you given me a complete list of the
7	documents that you're required to complete with
8	regard to arrests that you make?
9	A I believe so. I gave everything to the
LO	district attorney.
L1	Q When you approached Mr. Alicea at 172nd
L2	after receiving that point-to-point radio contact
L3	with Officer Baboolal, what would have been the
14	procedures that you could have used to retrieve
15	the marijuana that you claimed he swallowed?
16	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
17	A You asked me that question earlier and I
18	told you that I called Sergeant Cruz and he told
19	me to bring it into the precinct and I bring it
20	into the precinct and then the procedures was
21	taken over by Sergeant Cruz.
22	Q Is there anything else you could have
23	done at the scene to recover those drugs?
24	A No.
25	Q So notifying Sergeant Cruz, that's a

1	RIVAS
2	complete description of what you could have done
3	to obtain those drugs that you claim Mr. Alicea
4	swallowed?
5	MR. FARRAR: Objection.
6	A Yes.
7	Q Do you recognize this document?
8	(Handing document).
9	A (Perusing document). Yes.
10	MS. MASSIMI: Can you mark this.
11	
12	(Whereupon, the above-referred
13	to document was marked as
14	Plaintiff's Exhibit 3 for
15	Identification, as of this
16	date.)
17	
18	Q Can you read this criminal complaint?
19	(Handing document).
20	A (Perusing document). Yes.
21	Q This is the criminal complaint that you
22	completed related to this arrest, correct?
23	A Yes.
24	Q Is this a complete and accurate account
25	of the criminal activity that you believe

- 1 RIVAS
- 2 Mr. Alicea committed on that day?
- 3 A Yes.
- Q Did you complete any other paperwork
- 5 with regard to this arrest?
- 6 A No.
- 7 Q Are you familiar with a form called the
- 8 Arrest Data Display?
- 9 A No. I did the online which it pretty
- 10 much might be what it is. The online and
- 11 vouchers.
- 12 Q What did you voucher from Mr. Alicea?
- 13 A I have to refresh my mind on the voucher
- 14 on that.
- 15 Q You didn't retrieve anything illegal
- 16 from him, correct?
- 17 A No.
- 18 Q Do you know if any other officers
- 19 completed any other paperwork with regard to this
- 20 arrest?
- 21 A No.
- 22 Q Do you know what happened to the
- 23 prosecution of Mr. Alicea regarding this incident?
- 24 A Can you repeat that again.

) 1	RIVAS
2	prosecution of Mr. Alicea regarding this incident?
3	A Not until recently. You're saying if I
4	knew what happened; if they sent me a letter or
5	somebody called me, what happened that day with
6	him?
7	Q Did you receive any letters in the mail
8	about this incident?
9	A About the lawsuit, yes, but not the
10	incident, what happened.
11	Q Do you know what happened to
12	Mr. Alicea's criminal charges?
) 13	A No.
14	Q Would you be surprised to know that his
15	charges
16	A It was dismissed.
17	Q How do you know that they were
18	dismissed?
19	A When I spoke to the lawyers.
20	Q Which lawyers?
21	A The city lawyer.
22	Q That was the first time that you learned
23	that his charges were dismissed?
24	A Yes.

Do you know how many people you've

Q

1	RIVAS	
2	arrested in the course of your career where the	
3	charges have been dismissed; I think you testified	
4	earlier that you've made eight hundred arrests	
5	during the course of your career?	
6	A Not that many, yes.	
7	Q Do you know how many of the charges have	
8	been dismissed?	
9	A No.	
10	Ms. MASSIMI: Give me one moment.	
11		
12	(Whereupon, a brief recess was	
13	taken.)	
14		
15	Q This conditions unit that you were	
16	assigned to that day, was that your normal	
17	assignment?	
18	A Yes. That's the name of the unit,	
19	actually, that I'm part of.	
20	Q It's part of the 33rd Precinct?	
21	A Yes, it's called 33 Condition Unit.	
22	Q How many people are part of that unit?	
23	A It's on and off, some people leave.	
24	Right now I think it's like eight of us, I'm not	

25

sure.